

---

Living in a world of Nation state, Lisboa 8 9 décembre 2019, ISCTE World Net

## **State and Environment, Between Risk Management and Citizenship**

Gilles VERPRAET  
Sophiapol University Paris Nanterre

The nation state assumes a set of functions regarding the state of citizenship; It has been framed since the 19th century as a protective state on safety and risk management (Foucault, 2004, R Castel, 2003); health risks, pollution risks. From these premises was built in the 1960s, environmental protection policies on heritage and risk management. On these premises, environmental policies have developed on sustainable development policies to cope with the consequences of global warming with their social and environmental consequences.

With the analysis of the GIEC (2009-2015), on the carbon energy climate relations, energy policies have entered in the field of sustainable development (depending on the country) in the field of ecological claims). A large part of the energy policies (oil, gas) underlines their international dependence. The response of the States to these international dependencies (oil prices, and gas prices) depends on their own energy resource (wind hydroelectricity in Portugal)

The affirmation of an ecological citizenship facing the autonomous sovereignty of the State depends on the environmental pressure of the global warming and the price of the energies' according to triangle relations linking Global expectations, ecologist mobilization, sustainable State. There are shaping different responses in different countries (France, Portugal Germany, Japan) which require international comparisons. There is also a competition between policies of energy dependence (gas oil), and the construction of environmental policies. It is worth clarifying the combination of citizenship between territorial issues (bio diversity, agricultural production), national issues (energy dependence, energy prices), transnational issues (interdependence of energy policies, interdependence on global warming). It involves new arrangement between political citizenship, territorial citizenship and emerging ecological citizenship.

2/ Our first approach, questions the concepts of sovereignty and combined citizenship between Brazil, France, Korea, according to their different ways of coupling state and civil mobilizations shaping different histories. The stakes lead on the capacity of the Sustainable state) to arrange the coupling and the decoupling between the mobilizations of above (modernization, energy dependence) mobilization from below, to make converge the resistances and the development. Most of these countries are taken inside energy dependencies. They must assume some of the interdependence regimes within adequate social and institutional arrangements.

Transnational requirements (COP agreement, environmental standards) are developed through the states support and the mobilization networks within an adequate ecological modernization. The formula of hybrid citizenship supposes an enlargement of democracy to increase both these local territorial requirements and global requirements. The result frames a triangular scheme combining the demands of civil society, state norms, transnational global issues. Global expectations are moving at the local and global levels.

3/ The processes of transnational solidarity presuppose the existence of some sharing. National solidarity is organizing social differentiation around the institutions effectively regulated. In the panorama of uncertainty, social networks become a substitute for solidarity; a virtual solidarity. A typology of the existing transnational solidarities in international relations will specify three dominant approaches: relations between States with common interests and partnerships within the framework of inter-State relations; multilateral relations within the framework of the United Nations, such as UNEP and UNDP, and the diversity of Internet relations linking individual exchange and cultural exchange.

## **I/ World of State Nations Which interdependences and Diagramme ?**

Nation states seemed a self-sufficient political identity for countries with large agricultural resources (mercantilism in France 19 century), for countries with large industrial production (National Fordism of the 1930, 50's), possibly exporting (export lead development countries) (Evans, 2003; Jessop, 2006). With the development of trade and business, the competition between nation states concerns about the raw materials, the exports dependences in different figures of power systems (colonization, imperialism, postcolonialism, globalization) (Berger, 2003). Several wars were struggling in the 20th century not only on the territories, but also on access to sufficient energy, the oil wars (Koweit, Iraq Iran)

Federalism allowed the integration of these territorial problems by economies of scale and new extensive economy with enlargement and intensification of the economy, by an internal differentiation of territories between center and periphery. Usa Russia Europe have developed different economic and political constructions in terms of surplus, efficiency and demographic implication (Landes)

The place of the Nation state inside this regime of interdependence is specified within an increased specialization, on the possible gains in a chain of value (Singapore, Norway, Switzerland and Ireland within Europe, coming UK and Catalonia. But this national specialization inside global interdependencies must recognize the complexity of contemporary growth, the complexification of factors of production, coordination of resources and policies (Boyer, 2001) such as education, research, type of specialization.

The search for ethnic homogeneity, by some cultural homogeneity as an adaptive response seems to be a partial answer to this increased social and economic differentiation. So results some new social balances of directions between internal growth (consumption, construction, mobility) and external growth (TNC export of resources, export of products, export of know-how), between endogenous population and exogenous population (migrations)

It is important to recognize the new hierarchies between the leading countries, homogenous adaptive countries, countries within differentiated adaptation, country shifted inside economic decline (Wallerstein, 2004, Niedervee Pietersee, 2004). The national affirmation, inside this international situation takes different trajectories and political forms. Hungary politics argue for a national system of cooperation, UK Brexit argue for some new expert specialization outside the European common market, Energy competition and Trading high competition are leading the US framework

We may explicit the explanatory steps

a/ To specify the place and the specificity of the nation inside a regime of interdependence. This framework combine the opposition between nation axiology and dependence v interdependence axiology

b:/ The intertwining between national viewpoint and cosmopolitan viewpoint can enlighte how social interest proceed by specific mediations. This tension between nation and cosmopolitan are developing inside the construction of environmental politics. They have to combine vertical politics and horizontal politics, politics of energy and enlarged politics of biodiversity.

c/ So can be clarified the tense relations between civil state, State and environmental issues So can be examined the consequences of this dual and triangle configuration on the definition and the politics of ecological citizenship

C / Civil societies and State in the formation of the trajectories of sustainability (France Korea Brazil (

The question leads on the capacity of the State to manage the environment (framing a transient sustainable state) to arrange the coupling and the decoupling between the mobilizations from above (modernization, energy dependence) and the mobilization from below. Most of these countries are taken inside energy dependences, they must assume part of the interdependence regimes (policies of the arrangements) .Transnational requirements (Cop 21, environmental standards) are implemented the States legitimation (ecological modernization) and the networks of mobilization. The formula of hybrid citizenship supports an enlargement of democracy to bring to the both these local territorial requirements and global requirements It support a conjunction between universalist and particularist values)

The analytical result frames a triangle scheme combining the demands of civil society, state norms, transnational global issues. Several responses are developed by the ecological modernization of the State, by the capillary mobilization of the State and the civil society, in particular the social networks and their connections, by territories, and the development of the solidarities in the national trajectories. The debate between universalism v particularism can shape specific forms of local and national solidarity. In the field of ecological sustainability, we may observe different trajectories according to the civil mobilizations and the mobilizations of the ecological modernization (Mol et Spaargaren, 1992). The dynamic layers supporting the ecological expectations, confront with resistances coming from the owners and rural territories. It marks the difference between sustainable state and territorialized state. The central criterion underlines the division between energetic dependence and sustainability trajectories

### **Three Nations constructing sustainable trajectories**

France, the assertion of national sovereignty by nuclear energy (1965) contend with long-term environmental mobilizations and a consequent bio-diversity policy. The problems relate to the weakness of the policy of new energy nuclear wind, considering the place of energy dependencies. The resistance of the peripheral residents have increased on the eco-tax, on the oil guarantee of their peripheral autonomy

Korea faces a geo-political crisis over the weight and saturation of civilian and military nuclear energy (2017) imbricated inside the geo-political region (North Korea, Japan as a condition of national independence from the risk of war). The recent phase of democratization 2016 brings referendums on the opening of new power plants, the statement of a policy of denuclearization. The development of environmental policies is linked to tourism and industrial pollution an unequal policy mix.

Brazil shapes a very diverse federal country. Under the same nation state, several peoples and several territories may coexist. The tension between industrial farming and preservation of the environment is a problem of long duration. The mobilization of cities on environmental issues are more recent with grassroots community and associative development. If Brazil has an energy autonomy, its national sovereignty struggled deeply with internal, territorial, and social division.

### **Post national mobilizations and globalization of risks**

Beck (2003) analyzed the relations between internal politics and globalization. The interdependence order is conceptualized as a game of powers and counter powers. State formation concerns the civilizational rights, the asymmetry of power between the financial risks and the civilizational risks. The new relations between the global questions and the local questions filter inside the national politics. This has two consequences : Globality cannot be envisioned as a community of destiny. Globality is a fabric for global conflict and for global reflexivity“ (Held, 1999). The new forms of generalized exchange (communication, internet, firms) impulse new forms of power.

Ecological mobilizations for sustainable development can be envisioned as multi-level mobilizations. It is first of all local mobilizations to defend certain territories, certain natural spaces against pollution and the risks of degradation. They can be considered as conjunctions of resistance, on local issues (major works) on global issues (cop 21, cop 19). The interdependence of the inhabitants and world citizens in the face of global warming frames the dual line of action and reflection, such as “Think globally, act locally”. It involves the formation of local environmental policies, global preservation policies, medium-term policies on sustainable urban and local development (G Pleyers, 2010), within the ethical limits of environmental justice. Transnational solidarities appear as the most relevant normative responses. They are organized mainly by type of specific actors before engaging all citizens : Ecological bio farmers grouped in Via Campesina network; Scientists of global warming in the GIEC network; Intergovernmental Agreements in COP 21 Negotiations

**table1/ Interdependence, Energy politics, National claims**

Politic of Energy	<u>National Sovereignty</u>	<u>Environnemental Politics</u>	<u>Democratic Consequences</u>
Politic competition of	<u>Strong sovereignty of resources and exportation</u> <u>Weak autonomy if importation dependence</u>	<u>Economy of energy</u> <u>Substitution nuclear x benzin France</u>	
Politic partnership and dependancy of	<u>European countries x russian gaz</u>	<u>Minoration of environmental issues</u>	<u>Nationalist reclaiming</u>
Politic of federation	<u>Common agreement Common Market as Cee</u>	<u>Mutualism of environmental issues</u> <u>Weak engagement on energy mix</u>	<u>Shared Sovereignty</u> <u>Coordination for environmental trajectories</u>
Politic interdependences of	<u>Collectives risk v collective responsibilities</u>	<u>Democratic control of Nuclear Energy</u>	<u>I nterdependent Nations</u> <u>Energy Citizenship</u>

The risk of the globalizing approach is to reduce the political dimension in front of the ontological dimension. The necessity is to involve the States in the action and the transnational geo politics framing the security and the risks. state. The specific question is to articulate internal policies and external policies. This debate between ontological horizon and several levels of relevant policies balances the debate on the National / cosmopolitan position, reformulating the post-national state on the issues of sustainable development. (Verpraet, 2011)

## **II/National State modernization, in France : Regional Transition, Territorial Differentiation, Composition for sustainable trajectory**

In France, the assertion of national sovereignty over nuclear power is made up of long-term environmental mobilizations and a consequent bio-diversity policy.

b / The period of sustainable development initiated by the Brutland report in 1987 and the Voynet 1998 law, has grounded consequences in metropolitan areas. The deployment of sustainable development policies (transport, energy saving, environmental protection, risk management, requires institutional arrangements who sustain large scale changes 1995/2010

c / The period of resistance and conflict, 2015 2019. The problems relate to the weakness of the policy of new energies nuclear wind, which stress energy dependencies. It has increased with the resistance of the peripheral inhabitants on the eco-tax, on the oil guarantor of their autonomy of peripheral mobility (mobilization of yellow jackets

The classic figure of cohesive Nation State has to argue with the multiplication of territorial citizenship and new forms of globalizing ecological citizenship. A first solution in 2000 was to combine institutional arrangement and trajectories of sustainable development. A second period 2015/ 2019 underline new fractal tensions between regional politics and environmental versus territorial conflicts

### **§ 1 / Construction of Environmental policies between universalism and territories**

\*Environmental politics address the response inside a community of risks. How to protect together, how to define the short term solidarity before the institutions take the relay ?. Agenda 21 in Nantes (West of France)could prepare some new institutional arrangements, including the risks management, based on a common pools of resources (Ostrom, 1991). Social cohesion address different facets on the relations between social community and State organization. This notion requires more analytical development.

During the 1990's, the trend to global cities is counterbalanced by some political constructions to recontextualized the urban politics (Jessop, 2006, Crosta, 1999). So was elaborated a new analytical frames between urban societies, urban politics and system of governance. The theory of coordination induces different political and institutional solutions between the institutional fix (Jessop; 1999); the quango organization (Newman and Thornley), the design of new democratic structure (Maggio). These dilemmas can be distributed between the levels of government. The double structuration of government is sustained by his capacity to manage two levels of problems, the daily management and the global orientations. *The first opposition between the direction setting and the steering government indicate the double requirement of problems inside metropolitan government (Thornley, Newman, 1997).*

## **Urban regimes between growth, conservation and protection**

Urban regime connotes the informal arrangements that surround and complement the formal choices of government authorities between public and private orders. Clarence Stone has defined *four different regimes : maintenance or caretakers regimes, development regimes concerned with changing land use, middle classes progressive regimes which includes aims such as environmental protection, lower middle classes opportunity expansion regimes that emphasize human investment policy and widened access to employment and ownership.*

Kathy Mossberger questions *the role of selective incentives* :\_The three types of urban regimes (growth, maintenance, progressive) incorporate local dependence, selective incentives and purposive incentives. In this way the civic capacities can be extended to the Urban educational projects (Stone, 2003).. But such an extension of urban networks of interest requires a formalization on the criteria explicating” the construction of power, the construction of politics. She concluded by the political assessment : “*The appeal of the regime frameworks has been its ability in use a political economy approach to synthesize structure and agency*” (Mossberger ‘(2001)

In contrast with the regime theories of the 1990’s, Jessop develops a post regulation approach. His vision of integral economy such as Gramsci tends to envision the global determination by market, such as the American fordism of the 1930’s. His analysis underlines the effects of the social representation on the mediation inside the institutional analysis. This framework is supported by a specific analysis on the dynamics inside the Asian economies, such as state entrepreneurship in Singapur, as expert led economy in Japan, so to envision the change in the regulation systems; to connect more deeply the state development with the economic conditions (Evans, 2014). He criticizes a static approach of regulation so to develop a transformative approach of regulation leading on accumulation regimes: He makes explicit the different dimensions of this reappraisal for transformative regulations inside accumulation regime :

## **II - 2\*Institutional arrangements for sustainable development**

The political construction of sustainable development (e.g. the Agenda 21, sustainable planning, risk management, ecological activism, and civic environmentalism) requires to articulate different implementations. It involves a wide-ranging mobilization covering different institutions, actors and stakeholders. The global dimensions of climate change (International Group for Climate and Environment, Giec) involve the local actions of associations: NGOs and community groups of city and municipal administration (for practising the Agenda 21). The role of metropolitan government (by common institutions) involves shaping different functions: a role of communication between associations, community groups, elected members and professionals. A policy of coordination by: networks, professionals, agencies and policy set up implementation process. So results a new redefinition of the urban sustainability by the level of anticipation and social support. In this policy framework, we can question the mediatory role of metropolitan agencies that frame new mediations inside global /local relations.



The social and industrial territory of Plaine community located in the north of Paris (120.000 being employed out of 250.000 habitants) and Nantes Metropolis (500.000 habitants) have been transformed significantly since the late 1980s; This area study include larger presence of working class composing of 30 to 40 per cent, a lot more younger population, and much larger immigrants. In this framework of industrial, urban and sustainable trajectories, we can specify the role of pluri-communal institutions and the city enhancement of structural actions (requalification, public health, and environment). The social outcomes (territorial, institutional, politics, technical) of these political constructions can be clarified.

\*In Nantes the implementation process of sustainable development is sustained by metropolitan reorganization (Communauté urbaine in 2001). The Agenda 21 provides a framework for procedural actions in addition to other document of housing politics (PLH) of transportation. Therefore comes up some strong and continuous innovation on energy economy, such as eco-quarters, requalification of Ile of Nantes) can be developed. The community of risk can be a base for mutual and collaborative actions supported by institutional arrangements. St Denis and Plaine Commune have made the choice of cities with high population density, politics of urban requalification, eco-requalification with more urban intensities (population density, transport, eco-cycle)..

Within the territorial and metropolitan transversal dimensions, a large thematic of sustainability (environment, risks management, energy) can be framed. This gives rise to a thematic reorganization and new institutional arrangements for the institutional supports of public policy (Table 1). They promote the politic of “transversality” (the Agenda 21, SCOT) and City Politics (“politique de la ville”). The mutual and interdependent combinations between urban metropolis and environmental transversal dimensions in the model of development require some new institutional arrangements in the definition of metropolis development.

### **Urban differentiation, social debates and political coordinations**

In this framework of urban exchange, coordination and institutional arrangements develop multiple processes of social deliberation (The Agenda 21, council of development, community council). However we have to distinguish the collective of deliberation as community issue and the collective of decision as coalition legitimating a public policy. This is only at the level of decisional community that can be stabilized with certain referential matrix (Sabatier, 1989). The referential of sustainable development is fixed on the organization of sustainable transversality.

Within the large institutional changes, the instruments and dispositives settled for the risk management contribute to the stabilization of a pluri-communal “reference” frameworks. The official discourses and narratives insist on the continuity between private values and public values (partnership, development, mixed economy). A policy viewpoint has to specify the adjustments cost, inside the redefinition of the urban structure (local planning and land values, politic of requalification, conversion of brownfield). They promote new economy of scales, some new external economy (Baumol, 1994). Therefore the types of conflict emerge in the management of risks (environmental conflicts, political conflict, conflict of coordination).

**Table 1. Institutional Levels and Social Responsibilities on Risks : Multilevel State and Sustainability**

Cities / Municipality	Hygienic and Safety	Vulnerable Area / Vulnerable Population	Reference of Mayor
New Urban Communities/ Metropolis Agencies	Communality Management of Risks SCOT = Metropolitan Orientation Scheme Agenda 21, Climate Energy Plan (PCE)	Transversal Coordination  Urban Project Territories Transformations	Communalities Cultures  Deliberation
Department / Province	Agenda 21 for public services Environmental Pedagogy, in school, with association, Communication, Animation Climate Energy Plan (PCE)	Communication Social Links Social Care	Segmentation  Specific Population
Region	Great Risks, Seveso Risks Agro farming and Pollution Natural park protection Transportation modalities and distribution of population (SDAU)	Territorial Changes  Prospective	Regional Politics and Sustainability conflicts

Sustainable development is mobilizing community groups, representative and institutions in an “ascendant” mobilization. It groups institutions and local actors by top / down programme. The links between pedagogy and mobilization give a specificity to the implementation of sustainable development. Path dependency approach suggests that each step of sustainable development, requires some specific coordination of actions, and some social support by deliberation on the norms and the orientation (Pierson, 2001). The legitimation of the public action on sustainable development is in processes. We have already quote how conventional institutions are sustaining lateral mobilization by networks, by pragmatic linking of particular interest (Beaumont and Nichols).

## **The social dimensions of sustainable development and ecological citizenship**

The classical approach of sustainable development points out the fact that social inequality "are setting large constraints on the arrangement and on the policies of sustainable development (Harvey, 1996). Therefore, the territory of high risks is likely to be that of vulnerable population like flooding areas (observed in the 2004 flood of New Orleans in the USA) and industrial areas (Bullard). The activist approach of sustainable development pay attention to the appropriation of the thematic of sustainable development by local actors. Social issues can be mediated through by different channels such as local associations, community groups and their environmental claims –e.g. territorial politics of each municipal administration.

The behavioural changes concern the economy of energy, education and consumption, the changes of institutional norms (policies of energy and transportation). The ecological modernization of Metropolitan institutions (law SRU of 1998) seems to precede the social and ecological adjustments, which depend on the territorial choices of municipal politics and the management of territorial change. Some new relations between the economy of scale and adjustment costs as the rescaling and the descaling of public politics are created (Brenner, 2004).

### **II-3 / Environmental conflicts in Regions and tensions on Sustainable State**

The current processes of sustainable transition are involved after 2015 in a new period with a diversity of local actions for sustainability. In the french case of Loire Atlantic, we may identify three type of transitional territories. Countryside territories support the land protection but they require extended mobility, and are also reluctant to the economy of energy facing the benzine struggle. Peripheral territory are struggling between precarious life styles, urban consumption and constraint of mobility.

The road blockages against eco tax in 2015 were organized by truck drivers, self-employed, farmers Breton. The rallies on the logo "red cap" which was associating a strong cultural identity as Britany regionalism and the intensive development of industrial agriculture. Hence the retreat of the government, as a deferred measure, canceled in July 2015. There remains the feeling of distrust facing the state and its ecological policies.

The challenge of the airport question the attractiveness of Nantes Metropolis to new activities (airbus framework), the recovery of agricultural lands when Nantes Bouguenais airport face the pressure of urbanization. Ecological resistance is interpreted according to the theme of no growth, on the defense of bio diversity (Guerande), on the defense of agriculture. The actions combine mass demonstrations of 10,000 people with a media dimension and land occupations (130 students, precarious housings), resulting in an heterogeneous coalition sustaining other forms of life. Alliance between alternative ecologist and independent peasant are emerging. 60 precarious households can cultivate agricultural land as a laboratory of biodiversity. The

new ecology focus on the defense of bio diversity, a new compromise between farming and organic agriculture.

### **Contestation in the periphery The up rise of yellow jackets (2018 / 2019)**

The mobilization of the yellow jacket in 2018 2019 starts from a strong protest, with several causes. The mobilization refuses the increase of the eco tax (50 euros per ton) and its negative consequences on a high fuel prices. The high cost of peripheral mobility affects the monthly budget of precarious households. Media images expose the feeling of blocked lifestyles, a deep questioning on the constraints of the peripheral lifestyle (Meuse, South of France.) An analytical approach will be linking the struggle between lifestyles and planning styles (Genestier 2019).

The analysis of the mobilizations sustain the adjunction of different audiences around the roundabouts, between truck drivers, nurses and low-paid employees, retired peoples,, middle managers in the public service. Beside the independent professions resulting from the first mobilizations of the red cap are coming the public of precariousness. After two months of explosive demonstrations in the urban centers, the social demand, on the low wages on the precariousness tends to cover the territorial claim of the peripheral way of life, the peri-urban autonomy, on the ecological claim. The government responds in December 2018 by measures concerning the precariousness of pension and very low wages (a year bonus)

The initiative of the great debate (2019) on the four themes (taxation, environment, mobility, democracy) intends to curb the movement in the social and fiscal consensus. It intends to explore the deep underlying reasons for this explosion of anger between rich city centers and poor areas, and possibly move the coding of the movement. Beside the aspiration of poor retired residents and precarious employees, comes a limitation of the ecological aspiration on the daily eco practices. The movement of yellow vests remains fixed on the fiscal taxes and the referendum of popular initiative (R.I.C.), on a direct political expression on the financial choices.

We notice the increased differentiation of the territories of lifestyles (suburban, peri urban, rural center). It can be diagnosed three territories of lifestyles and project \_In the case of Loire Atlantic, we may identify three types of transitional territories, three community of issues, each one develops his own conception of ecological transitions. The universal / particular couplings are developed in the ecological action in the municipal mediation, The resistances come from particular territories, peripheral territories, precarious rural territories, but which can assemble and make aggregation. Metropolis transition demonstrates his capacity of coordination on the economy of energy and management of risks inside a coordinate model of sustainable urban development. Countryside territories require extended mobility, and they are also reluctant to the economy of energy facing the gasoline struggle. Peripheral territory are struggling between precarious life styles, urban consumption and constraint of mobility.

These conflicts frame the diffraction of citizenships between territorial citizenship and urban citizenship, between political citizenship and peripheral citizenship. The implementation of environmental policies increases for populations, the feeling of territorial differentiation and social differentiation, with their socio-territorial interactions

## Region as transient territory for a sustainable State

The study of regional policies, their content is a manner to clarify the meaning of these territorial revolts, their content, their questioning of environmental policies, the sustainable state. The rural / urban conflicts focus on densities and land pressure on agricultural land (Hamman, 2012). They move today on the conflict between rural agriculture / organic farming, on the protection of water resources. The regional policy of the Region des Pays de Loire (3, 7 million inhabitants, 117 inhabitants KM<sup>2</sup> 2 surface, 32000 KM<sup>2</sup>) frames a selective policy oriented territories and agricultural enterprises. It assumes its orientation on a policy of agro diversity. Environmental policy manages coastal risks raised after flooding incidents in the Charente Sea

Regional policy is less assured on the energy transition, on the renovation of buildings, on an indicative construction of rural mobility. The search for renewable energies remains experimental (wind energy project, electrical car). The energy saving dispositives is referred to the cities Nantes against Angers. The coordination of energy cycles is delegated to department with Plan Climat Energy. This policy of uncertainty has consequences in the heterogeneous mobilization of cities (Nantes, Angers St Nazaire, Laval). It assumes a policy of privileged territories (agro) and territories at risk (forest and parks). The mobilizations of yellow jacket highlight the weakness of regional policies on peripheral mobility, on energy savings to develop. It combines a peri-urban crisis and crisis of the regional development model.

Regional politics mobilize differently the three identified territories of issues. Countryside territories support the land protection but they require extended mobility, and are also reluctant to the economy of energy facing the gasoline struggle. Peripheral territory are struggling between agro protection and Metropolis mobilization on sustainable development (§ 2).

At the regional level the coordination of action by explicit public politics, require more flexibility in a *federative combination* between differentiated territorial actions. Some conflicts emerge between urban and rural population, between stable and precarious population v workforce are developing at regional level. The urban region is fractalized in diversity of trajectories (rural region). The stabilization of the policies of sustainable development requires a sustainable welfare state, protecting the populations, supporting the social solidarity on the eco taxes. We presented the tensions strongly expressed between political citizenship, territorial citizenship, ecological citizenship. We may evaluate this crisis of financial incentives in regard with the possibility of coordination of action and federalization of risks.

**Table 3 Dual politics inside Climate Transition (Energy Transition, Biodiversity Politics)**

	<i>Energy Transition</i>	<i>Bio Diversity Politics</i>
<i>Dispostives</i>	<i>Energy system, autonomy and distribution</i>	<i>Territories and Eco systems</i>
<i>Behaviour</i>	<i>Information and autonomy of behavior</i>	<i>Territorial attachment</i>
<i>Metropolis</i>	<i>New energy system Geothermy Public transport Multi modes</i>	<i>Environmental politics Biotechnopolis</i>
<i>Periurban</i>	<i>Wind energy, solar energy Car consumption</i>	<i>Conflict rural land urbanization Bio farming and peri urban</i>
<i>Region</i>	<i>Innovation on new energy</i>	<i>Agro ecology Coastal protection Park protection</i>
<i>Nations State</i>	<i>Coordination, Concentration Balance of energy system Prices of imported energy National export deficit</i>	<i>Biodiversity mapping and rules of protection</i>

### **Multiscale governance between local State and national state**

The local institutions and the local government play a specific role, so to adapt the actions of sustainable development by urban context and by social relevance. Metropolitan government has the specificity to coordinate the local actions, the public policies to modify the model of urban development in a more sustainable process. They develop a large influence by implementing some differentiated capabilities of actions.

The central State may keep a central role to impulse a rhythm and an agenda of modernization between sustainable development and industrial models. It may sustain or frame the role of metropolitan institution. The key issues concerns compromises between public norms, local mobilization and modernization of the eco-industrial models. In the current situation redefining the State authorities, experiencing the sustainable development policy, is not assumed the convergence of norms and rules between central state (by norms) and local state, with flexible coordination and autonomous institution. Different trajectories can be developed by coordination and deliberation.

\*Within this approach, we may compare the social outcomes in the production of the urban sustainabilities between national policies of the nation state and the policies of the local state:

- The politics of the nation state focuses upon the debates on the politics of energy, on transportation priority and economy of energy. Besides the media debates, new eco technologies are envisioned.
- The politics of local state on sustainable development may articulate citizenship mobilizations on concrete issues, with the framing of alternative way of life (compact district, soft mobility). We may notice different urban solutions, different urban assemblages between nature, social territories and institutional coordination.
- ☐ The regional area is leading the issues stakes on biodiversity, on agricultural land, on mobility policies

**We** have to examine the effects of state norms (energy, environment, sustainable development) on the local coordinations (stabilization, framing, control). So result multiple combinations between local States facing central norms. This is the heuristic to analyse the urban and metropolitan trajectories and their institutional arrangement. How they change the local coordination and the norms of reference.

\*In a first approach, we may notice some stability in the analysis of social compromises bounded around the urban politics and the environmental politics. The participation on the urban politics and the politics of sustainability, is more sustaining some (technical) arrangements between urban middle classes and central elites (Hajer, 2005).

\*Environmental compromises are destabilized by the new sustainable development policy. Energy transition and biodiversity are two pathways of sustainable development. two types of compromise and institutional arrangements. The classic tools of land use and property planning must be confronted or combined with incentive policies that support energy policies (market, finance, taxes). These questions are persistent in different countries, in different Nation State such as Brazil and Korea

### III/ Brazilian Trajectories: Federalism, Regions and Territories

Brazil presents a differentiated federal State where the idea of a Nation state has been under tension within the segmented economic opening on the agro industrial and oil sector. The sustainable development is taken under these tensions between export and household, between urban ecologist population, Indian population and industrial farming population. Three periods can be specified in the construction and deconstruction of environmental politics shaping a weak coordination of sustainability inside the nation State.

A / The economic and agricultural situation is dominated, since long by the monoculture of soybeans transformed into bioethanol with its consequences on agro biodiversity and the reduction of natural areas. The question was addressed in the 1970s 1980 for complementarity between environment and development (I Sachs 1970, Guimaraes, 1991).

B/ The configuration of 1990s enhanced the implementation of partial reforms, of environmental policies on strategic points of the environmental crisis : coast protection agency, amazon protection agency. Water pollution, especially by mercury, is a primary concern for environmental health. So are rising the issues of mine pollution in the Minas Gerais, hence the restoration of urban rivers in metropolitan areas (Coste and Vescona, 2010<sup>1</sup>). The defense of heritage and an eco-pedagogy take place in some localities, such a case of Pirai da Serra in Parana.

The main dynamic in the 1990's sustain the development of community associations, of NGOs who address the issue of mutual aid, the fight against poverty and the question of ecology. The meaning purpose of NGOs in Brazil intends to combine social justice, philanthropy and ecology (Cardoso Lima-Neto, 2013<sup>2</sup>). This movement can be interpreted in the European sense as the implementation of an associative-based solidarity economy (Laville, Guerin, 2007<sup>3</sup>)

We consider the institutional and municipal transformations allowed by this community dynamic during the Cardoso period and the Lula period. In this second interpretation, the municipal reorganization sustains a distributive amplification of the civil society (Baiocchi and Silvani, 2011<sup>4</sup>). The dual combination of institutional reform and local democracy enhances a deployment of civil society (Baoichi 2008). This is the case of well-known participatory budgets in Porto Alegre. This is the case of transport schemes in Currutiba.

---

<sup>1</sup> Environmental restoration of urban rivers in the metropolitan region of Rio de Janeiro, Brazil

L SA Costa, L Vescina... - Environnement Urbain ..., 2010 -

<sup>2</sup> Cardoso Lima-Neto, le sens des ONG au Bresil, justice sociale, philanthropie et écologie EHESS, 2013

<sup>3</sup> Jean Louis Laville, Isabelle Guerin, ÉCONOMIE SOLIDAIRE : DES INITIATIVES LOCALES À L'ACTION PUBLIQUE. INTRODUCTION, Revue Tiers mondes, 2007/2 n° 190 | pages 245 à 253 21 no |

<sup>4</sup> Baiouocchi G et Silva M 2011 Making Space for Civil Society: Institutional Reforms and Local Democracy in Brazil, Social Forces 2008



Within these associative and institutional frames of the years 1990 and 2000, a protection of the Amazon was developed with the cooperation of residential populations, Indian tribes Xingdu in particular (Albert, 2001<sup>5</sup>). On these bases was developed a Brazilian ecological movement, especially with the figure of Marina de Silva. She ran in the 2010 presidential election for the Green Party, (19.3% of voices), in 2013 for the PSB (21 % voices). But the reversal is complete in 2018 with 1% of the vote.

\*The extension of this diversified ecological policy in a diversified federal territory according to the territories requires a broad scheme of institutions between agencies, territories, solidarity economies.. It is necessary to recognize some weakness of the public space in Brazil, sustained by communities and religious associations and not by rationalist administrative arguments (Da matta, Enunes, 1995). The mobilization of urban youth on transportation in 2012 and the consequent questioning of municipal management, erode the civil links between associative movement and urban governance, supporting the legitimacy of urban institutions. The youth crisis on transportation and therefore on municipal and regional policies will shatter the coalition PT in July 2012

c/ The reverse of the 2018 elections, after the PT hegemony over municipalities and the federal government, facilitates a priority return of the old themes of industrial agriculture, exports and the interests of the old ruling classes related to these interests. Many environmental conflicts are visible such as dam collapse with loss of population, such as pollution of the North East coast on 100 km by an oil tanker. The most emblematic conflict contends the extension of agricultural lands v protective approaches in the Amazon, The fires of the Amazon in September 2019 contribute to make this conflict visible. It gives rise to a media and geopolitical debates how to contain these fires.

The coordination of environmental State to enable sustainable development trajectories is taken under these tensions between export and residence, between urban ecologist population, Indian population of the Amazon and industrial agricultural population. The duality of the environmental State between global interdependences and territorial requalification meets an expression exacerbated in a federal state very differentiated.

We emphasized the tensions between the predatory state and the concern for protection, based on the long-term opposition between the patrimonial state and the managerial state (Bresser Ferreira, 2009). The difficulty of building a social state is linked to the difficulty of continuous environmental protection. The arguments of ecological citizenship are expressed territorially in the first concerns of Indian populations and in some Metropolis. The construction of Environmental issues and environmental claims needs to be examined at the regional level in this large federal country.

---

<sup>5</sup> bruno Albert IRD, association amérindienne et développement durable au bresil  
**Recherches Amérindiennes au Québec; Montréal** Vol. 31, N° 3, (2001): 49-58,2,137

#### IV/ Environmental politics of modernization and democratization in Korea

Korea is a middle size country (50 millions habitants) concentrated on the intensification of the half territory after the North South division in 1953. The strong industrialization of the years 1970 s and 2000s set questions on industrial pollutions and water pollution such as Dong Ra river the Tong River (S Y Han 2008)<sup>6</sup> The societal response has been elaborated in term of ecological and democratic modernization (Mol Spaargaren 1998, Evans 2014<sup>7</sup>)

Since the 1970's, a policy of coastal protection is implemented considering the important traffic inside the China and Japan Sea (S G Kim 2010 <sup>8</sup>).The environmental protection is supported by the solidarities of ethnic communities attached by a strong feeling of environmental justice (S H Hong, 2011<sup>9</sup>). Park and Forest are managed also under State protections, such as the mountains of Kangwoon Province's Youngwol, Jeongseon, and Pyeongchang. The ecological modernization is proceeding mainly by technics and standards in active City Planning and Air pollution (Y M Kim, 2009<sup>10</sup>, Y Lee, 2011)

-The political of modernization leads an important step of Korea fighting against dictatorship in the 90's.The education to citizenship is a deep concern also for environmental politics (SY Tang, 2002<sup>11</sup>). The ethic of environment comes as an explicit concern inside this country of religion and confucianism (Melo 2015 <sup>12</sup>) -Korea faces a geo-political crisis over the weight and saturation of civilian and military nuclear energy imbricated inside the geo-political region (North Korea, Fukushima in Japan) as a condition of national independence from the risk of war. The recent phase of democratization 2016 brings referendums on the opening of new power plants, the statement of a policy of denuclearization (Sun Ji Yum 2017). The consultation on the extension of nuclear plant named Hsin Kori 5 and 6 is argued as a sensitive development for the concept of energy citizenship (Sun Jin Yun 2017 <sup>13</sup>)

The nature of the Korean state is generally referred as a state lead modernization (Evans, 2014, Jessop, 2006). The importance of Mandarin management (Wollerstone, 2013) does not prevent multiple modernizations Industrial modernization, political

---

<sup>6</sup> Valuing environmental impacts of large dam construction in Korea: An application of choice experiments SY Han, SJ Kwak, SH Yoo - Environmental Impact Assessment Review, 2008 - Elsevier

<sup>8</sup> Evans P B- The South Korean Development Experience, 2014 - Springer

<sup>8</sup> The evolution of coastal wetland policy in developed countries and Korea  
SG Kim - Ocean & Coastal Management, 2010 - Elsevier

<sup>99</sup> Biocultural diversity and traditional ecological knowledge in island regions of Southwestern Korea, SK  
Hong - Journal of Ecology and Environment, 2011 - koreascience.or.kr

<sup>10</sup> Ubiquitous eco-city planning in Korea. A project for the realization of ecological city planning and ubiquitous network society YM Kim, HS Kim, SY Moon, SY Bae - 2009 -

<sup>11</sup> Democratization and environmental policy-making in KoreaJH Lim, SY Tang - Governance, 2002 - Wiley Online Library

<sup>1212</sup> Should ecological citizenship advocates praise the green state? C Melo-Escrihuela - Environmental Values, 2015 -

<sup>1313</sup> cf Sun Jin Yun 2017 Public engagement in decision- making process for nuclear phase out in Souh Korea and environmental justice in association Korean of environnement environmental justice, kumi 2017

modernization, ecological modernization support each other but move forward with different rhythms

The expectations of ecological citizenship require rural and community solidarities, within an ethical positioning on the issues of pollution and the protection of the environment. The process of democratization relays the anti nuclear demands. It is difficult to qualify a sustainable state at both central and municipal levels. The nature of the state environment, in process would combine, an ecological modernization by its standards and deeply rooted ethical dimensions

---

### **Conclusions; Multilevel State and Sustainable Trajectories**

The idea of nation-state appears fragmented by environmental policies between the tension between energy policy and bio-diversity policy; It implies a renewed articulation between the internal logic and the external logic of the State. The nation state appears destabilized by the multiplication of territorial actions and the social and territorial demands that are emerging in these territories. The case studies show the tension between community modernization from below and normative modernization from above.

The central State may keep a central role to impulse a rhythm and an agenda of modernization between sustainable development and industrial models (Korea). It may sustain or frame the role of metropolitan institution (France Brazil). The key issues concerns compromises between public norms, mobilization and modernization of the eco-industrial models. In the current situation redefining the State authorities, and experiencing the sustainable development, is not assumed the convergence of norms and rules between central state (by norms) and local state, with flexible coordination and autonomous institution. Different trajectories can be developed by coordination. Within this approach, we may compare the combination and the trajectories in the production of the urban sustainabilities between national policies of the nation state and the policies of the local state:

#### **New spaces of the state and sustainable development**

The local institutions and the local government play a specific role, so to adapt the actions of sustainable development by urban context and by social relevance. The local state (metropolitan agencies, regional state) may federate and coordinate the local actions for sustainable development by networking and flexible coordination. It can give place to local communities and groups inside mix economy, local development and collaborative practices. So result large consequences of the local bureaucracies, how they can shape social networks and informational networks. The local coalition of power have to make their choices between the territorial based normative bureaucracy and the postmodern bureaucracy, better related with the social networks for environment (association, risk management).

Central State sustains a normative role in the construction and the protection of markets, such as the building and housing market (with economy of energy), car market (carbon balance and fiscal policy), water infrastructure and quality of water, as technological and eco technological innovation. The normative dimension of a State keep a sense of responsibility in the risk management, a classic mission of the regalian state, moves in contradiction with extension of fiscal measures in a neo liberal State. This question concerns the relation between central state coalitions and the diverse plural local coalitions.

We examine the effects of state norms (energy, environment, sustainable development) on the local coordinations (stabilization, framing, control). So result multiple combinations between local States facing central norms. This is the heuristic to analyse the metropolitan trajectories and their institutional arrangement, how they change the local coordination and the norms of reference.

### Comparison of Sustainable Trajectories support between Multilevel States

Multilevel State	France	Korea	Brazil
Energy Policy	Energy mix Nuclear, Oil, new energies	Energie mix	Oil production Bioethanol production
Coupling and Decoupling State levels	Etat généraux Difficulties on transition plan Eco tax mobilization	State modernization  Civic pressures for denuclearization	Weak State  Weak regional coupling  Strong regional différenciation
Municipal and regional coordination	Municipal Coordination  Institutional arrangement	Coordination of innovation politics  Weak municipal differentiation	Communities mobilization Precarious municipal Coordination Conflict on transport
Differentiation of territorial politics	Conflict center / periphery  Differentiation of rural territories	Industrial Pollutions	Federalism and différenciation  Différenciation on agro exploitation

\* We notice different trajectories according to civil mobilizations and mobilizations from above, that of ecological modernization. Dynamic support groups carrying ecological expectations, clash with resistance from landowners and rural territories. So are framing the divisions between sustainable state and territorialized state, the division between energetic dependence and sustainability trajectories. The policy issues lead on the capacity of the sustainable State to arrange the coupling and the decoupling between the mobilizations of above (modernization, energy dependence) and the mobilization from below, to make converge the resistances and the development, because most of these countries are caught in energy dependences. They must assume some of the interdependence regimes.

### **The development of Post National State v Transnational Solidarities**

\*The post-national state is formed at the intersection of rationalities and multiple legitimacies (Habermas, 1998). They underline the question of national sovereignty inside international exchanges, by integration of national knowledge in a social space (Susan Strange). The question of the post-national state intends to arrange the types of subjects and these global economic orientations (Habermas, Sassen), so to articulate the financial rationality and these different types of subjects (C Brown). The State framework is reformulated as the conjunction and disjunction of social logics within the social space (Bourdieu), as an articulation of plural rationality in the political space (Habermas) with the dyssimmetry of regulatory logics and dominant logic (Beck).

The weakness of transnational interdependences is appreciated inside negotiated exchanges, who are not stabilized by institutions, destabilized by permanent negotiations. In times of crisis and austerity, internal fragmentation and competition between countries recover the solidarities and interdependencies. A central question of human development is to transform the unequal economic exchange into positive cultural exchange, to prepare other types of economic exchange, according to the ecology of knowledge (BV Santos).

The State appears destabilized by these unstable interdependences between competition, agreement, solidarity, north/ south redistribution (France 2010, France 2019; Brazil 2010, Brazil 2019). The state is also delegitimized by the differentiation of social space and new types of subject. The constitution and the stabilization of the State concerns the concordance between economic rationality (Weber), the social rationality (Mannheim), the institutional coordination-(Durkheim). In the classical association between interdependence, state, social space, new causal chains are framed between competitive internationalization, weak state, half-positioned subject, So result new articulation of social sciences between competitive economy, formal state, precarious welfare, unstable geo politics

\*The Habermas 's analyzis of the 1990's underline the tensions of the post national between nationalism and republicanism. *"The republican idea can take the lead in penetrating socially integrating forms of life and structuring them in accordance with universalistic patterns... (Habermas, 1996).« The republicanism has to take his own flight. The constitutional patriotism can take the place of the initial nationalism. The citizens*

*have to recognize the claims of their rights, as social security, as reciprocal recognition of different cultural forms”* p 109. This extension of democratic citizenship above the nation state require an extension of the concept of public space as a political public space “ In the complex society, the public space can be constituted as an intermediary structure who make a figure of mediation between the political system and the private actors”. To respond to this apory, Habermas develops an extensive concept of political public space.

\*Citizenship is envisioned as the foundational concept of a European collective identity, as a meta narrative for European integration (Eder, 2001). The key question comes to consider the European collective identity as a precondition of a democratic Europe. In this approach, the notion of citizenship moves as a meta narrative, as a practice of participation who precedes the construction of the public sphere..

The policy debate focus on the most relevant levels of global environmental action between a global policy through connections of actions and networks, by building global environmental governance (Stern report, 2004). The risk of the globalizing approach is to reduce the political dimension in front of the ontological dimension (Saito) The necessity is to involve the States in the action and the transnational geo politics on the security and the risks. The specific question of sustainable State moves to articulate internal policies and external policies. This debate between ontological horizon and performance of relevance policies rejoins the debate on the National / cosmopolitan position, reformulating the post-national state on the issues of sustainable development

### **\*Environmental solidarities between local solidarities and transnational solidarities**

The purpose of transnational solidarity challenges the social frameworks of the 19th and 20th centuries that developed the institutions of army and finance, schooling and social security (with the mutualisation of risks). Post-national solidarity is more difficult to organise within institutions. National solidarity is organising social differentiation around the institutions effectively regulated international institutions (such as transnational diasporas). In the panorama of uncertainty, social networks become a substitute for solidarity; a virtual solidarity (Langman, 2004). Through a typology of the existing transnational solidarities in international relations we will specify three dominant approaches :

- relations between States with common interests and partnerships established through the framework of inter-State relations;
- multilateral relations within the framework of the United Nations, supporting common goods, networks and federative associations such as UNEP and UNDP,
- the diversity of Internet relations linking individual exchanges and cultural exchange (such as the free-expression website).

Transnational solidarity on environmental issues can be analysed as a community of issues, as a politicization on common issues and problems; as an interconnection of issues and a cosmopolitanism. National solidarities around energy politics combine solidarity of production and distribution with solidarity for new frameworks inside an economy of energy such as Networked Climate Actions/ Cop 21. Transnational common concerns to save the earth as a community of issues: WWF, Green Peace, Attac, Cop 21.

Transnational solidarities and the purpose of a sharing society, are moving in process. These developments require new connections between peoples and countries, new assemblages between communities, political community and the claims of justice. Voluntary solidarity requires the development of the communities of issues overcoming the functional communities.

Gilles VERPRAET  
University Paris Nanterre  
November 2019

---

### **Bibliography**

- Acemoglu D et Robinson J (2013) Why Nations Fail? The origin of power, prosperity and poverty, Profile books
- Amin A, (1999), Post fordism and regionalism, Blackwell
- Anderson B (1983) The Imagined Community, reflections on the origin and sprawls of Nationalism London
- Beaumont J and Nichols W, (2007), Plural Governance, participation in democratic change,
- Beck U (2002), Macht und Gegenmacht in der global Zeitalter Surkhampf
- Berger S (2013) Notre première mondialisation, Leçon d'un échec collectif, Seuil
- Brand P, (2007), Green subjection, the politics of neo liberal urban environmentalism, International Journal of Urban and regional Planning, vol 31, N 3, 2007, pp 616-632
- Brenner Neil,(2004) New States Spaces. Urban Governance and the Rescaling of Statehood. 2004, Oxford University
- Bresser Ferrera C (2009) From the patrimonial State to the managerial State in
- Wihelm J et Pinheiroe P (2009), Brazil, a century of change, University of North Carolina Pees
- Cabrera L (2010), The practices of global citizenship CUP 2010
- Calhoun 'C (2004) Nationalism, University of Minnesota Press
- Castel R (2003), L'insécurité sociale, qu'est ce qu'être protégé, Seuil
- Castel M (1999),The power of Identity, Blackwell
- Dunlap R, Dickens O et alii (2002), Sociological Theory and the Environment, Classical Foundations, Contemporary Insights, Rowman and Littlefield.
- Dryzeck J (2004) Deliberative Democracy and Beyond; Oxford University Press
- Eder Kl et Giesen B (2004) European Citizenship and Transnational Projects, Oxford University Press
- Evans P B (2014) The South Korean Development Experience, 2014 - Springer  
- The South Korean Development Experience, 2014 - Springer
- Foucault M (2004), Sécurité, Territoires, Populations, cours du collège de France 1977 – 1978
- Fung A and Wright E. O (2003), Deepening democracy; Institutional Innovation in Empowerment participation, in Sintomer
- Habermas J (1996), Between Facts and Norms, MIT Press
- Hajer M (2005), Authoritative Governance, Policy Making in the Age of Mediatisation, Oxford Press
- Harvey D, (1994), Justice, Nature and the Geography of Difference, Blackwell
- Hobsbawn,(1990) Nations and Nationalism since 1780 Programmes, Myths, Realities, Cambridge University Press

- Jessop B (2006), *Beyond the regulationist approach*, Edward Elgar
- Jurgensmeyer(2004), M Religious Nationalism confronts secular state, University of California Press
- Latour B (2006), *Changer de société, Refaire de la sociologie*, La découverte
- Laurie M,(1997), *Reconstructing Urban regimes power, regime urban politics in a Global Era*, Sage,
- Mol A (1995), *The refinement of production, Ecological modernization theory, and the chemical industry*, Van Aekel, 1995
- Montesquieu Charles (1976) *The spirit of laws*, University of California Press
- Mossberger, K, (2001), *The evolution of urban regime theory*, *Urban affairs* 2001/ vol 36
- North D (1990), *Institutions, Institutional change and Economic Performance* Cambridge University Press
- Niederveen Petersee J (2004) *Globalization or Empire*, Routledge
- Perrulli P (1995), *Stato, Region, Economi di Rete*, *Stato e Mercato*, 44, August 1995, pp 231-259
- Pierson P, (2004), *Politics in Time, History, Institutions and Social analysis*, Princeton U Press
- Pleyers G (2010) *After Globalization°; Becoming Actors in the Global Age*, Polity
- Renan E (1887/ 1992) *Qu'est ce qu'une nation, ?* AGora
- Robertson R (1992) *Globalization, Social Theory and Global Culture*, Sage
- Sachs I (1991) *Environnement et Développement*, Unesco/ Most
- Santos B (2014), *Epistémologie des Sud*, Desclée de Brouwer
- Smith A (2008); *The cultural foundations, of Nations*, 2008
- Spaargaren, G. and A. P. Mol. (1992). *Sociology, environment and modernity: Ecological modernisation as a theory of social change*. *Society Nat. Resources* 5(4):323-344.
- Stone Cl (1995), *Regime politics, Governing Atlanta 1946-1988*, University Press of Kansas.
- Urry J, 2016, *What is the Future*, Polity Press,
- Verpraet G (2007), *Développement urbain durable et gestion des risques*, CNRS PIDDUD
- Wallerstein I (2004) *World system Analyzis, An Introduction*, Duke University
- Wallerstein I (2011), *The modern world system, Centrist Liberalisme triumphant, 1873 1914*, University of California Press
- Woolside, (2013)° *Lost Modernities, China Vietnam Korea, the hazardous effects*, Harvard University Press,
-